

NEW YORK HISTORY

FENIMORE ART MUSEUM
AND THE
STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK—
COLLEGE AT ONEONTA

SUMMER/
FALL
2018

99/3-4

FENIMORE ART MUSEUM

OFFICERS

Jeffrey H. Pressman
CHAIRMAN

Thomas O. Putnam
VICE CHAIRMAN

Richard C. Vanison
TREASURER

Alexander R. Charlton
SECRETARY

Stephen M. Duff
ASSISTANT TREASURER

NON-TRUSTEE OFFICERS AND SENIOR STAFF

Paul S. D'Ambrosio
PRESIDENT AND CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

Joseph Siracusa
VICE PRESIDENT FOR OPERATIONS

Barbara Fischer
SENIOR DIRECTOR OF HUMAN RESOURCES

John Ferguson
DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION

Todd Kenyon
DIRECTOR OF MARKETING

Chris Rossi
DIRECTOR OF EXHIBITIONS

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

Stephen M. Duff
Douglas E. Evelyn
Kathleen Flanagan
Nellie Gipson
Shelley Graham
Robert E. Hanft
Josef E. Jelinek
Charles B. Kieler
Erna Morgan McReynolds
Anne Older
Jeffrey Pressman
Thomas O. Putnam
Doris Fischer Malesardi
Ellen Tillapaugh
Richard C. Vanison

EX-OFFICIO

The Hon. Andrew M. Cuomo

FEBRUARY 2019

FENIMORE
ART MUSEUM

HISTORY

NEW YORK

QUARTERLY JOURNAL OF
FENIMORE ART MUSEUM
AND THE
STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK—
COLLEGE AT ONEONTA

COOPERSTOWN, NEW YORK

SUMMER/
FALL
2018

99/3-4

EDITORIAL BOARD

PAULA BAKER
STUART M. BLUMIN
PATRICIA U. BONOMI
LESLIE E. FISHBEIN
TIMOTHY J. GILFOYLE
KENNETH T. JACKSON
LISA KELLER
TIMOTHY J. SHANNON
ROBERT W. SNYDER
CRAIG S. WILDER

EDITORS

Thomas D. Beal
D.L. Noorlander
Susan Goodier

New York History (ISSN 0146-437x) is a peer reviewed journal published four times a year by Fenimore Art Museum in partnership with State University of New York, College at Oneonta. Submitted articles should deal in an original fashion with the history of the state. Articles that deal with the history of other areas, or with general American history must have a bearing on New York State history. It is assumed that the article will have some new, previously unexploited material to offer or will present new insights or new interpretations. Suggested length is 4500 words.

We ask that authors submit articles electronically. Submissions as well as footnotes should be double-spaced. Provision and costs of images for articles are the responsibility of the author. *New York History* employs, with some modification, note forms suggested in the *Chicago Manual of Style*. Submissions can be sent directly to Fenimore Art Museum Publications Department publications@fenimoreart.org

The journal will process submissions as quickly as possible, but three to six months should be allowed for a thorough reading. *New York History* does not pay for author's articles.

CONTENTS

- 257** | Editors' Introduction
THOMAS D. BEAL, D.L. NOORLANDER, SUSAN GOODIER
- 260** | "After the ceremony of the minister was over, the ceremony of the crowd began":
The Evolution of the Skimelton, a Rural New York Wedding Tradition
THOMAS S. WERMUTH
- 293** | "We are not objects of pity":
New York Sailors and the Embargo of 1807
PHILIP G. SWAN
- 331** | Not a Model:
First Lady Julia Gardiner Tyler and New York City's Print Culture
SHARON WILLIAMS LEAHY
- 356** | *State v. Charles Conroy*:
New York City Photographers' Battle for Free Speech in the Late Nineteenth Century
AMY WERBEL
- 370** | "Not the True Centennial":
The Politics of Erie Canal Celebrations, 1917–1926
CAROL SHERIFF
- 409** | Plum Blossom Fêtes and Japanese Lantern Balls:
Narcissa Cox Vanderlip and 1920s US-Japan Cultural Exchange
LINDA L. JOHNSON
- 440** | High Anxiety in St. Lawrence County:
Citizen Action and U.S. Military Flights, 1989–1992
NEIL S. FORKEY
- 464** | Book Reviews
New Books on New York
Book Review Essay
- 464** | *Embattled River: The Hudson and Modern American Environmentalism and Waterfront Manhattan: From Henry Hudson to the High Line*
REVIEWED BY DAVID SOLL

CONTENTS

- 469** | *From Loyalists to Loyal Citizens: The DePeyster Family of New York*
REVIEWED BY HEATHER SCHWARTZ
- 472** | *The Founders and Finance: How Hamilton, Gallatin, and Other Immigrants Forged a New Economy*
REVIEWED BY KATE ELIZABETH BROWN
- 475** | *Taming Manhattan: Environmental Battles in the Antebellum City*
REVIEWED BY ELENA SHABLIY
- 478** | *Respectability on Trial: Sex Crimes in New York City, 1900–1918*
REVIEWED BY RICHARD F. HAMM
- 481** | *Lust on Trial: Censorship and the Rise of American Obscenity in the Age of Anthony Comstock*
REVIEWED BY LAURA WITTERN-KELLER
- 484** | *Gilded Suffragists: The New York Socialites Who Fought for Women's Right to Vote*
REVIEWED BY KAREN PASTORELLO
- 487** | *In Pursuit of Privilege: A History of New York City's Upper Class and the Making of a Metropolis*
REVIEWED BY PETER EISENSTADT
- 492** | *The Drunken Duchess of Vassar: Grace Harriet Macurdy, Pioneering Feminist Classical Scholar*
REVIEWED BY KATE CULKIN
- 496** | Contributors

Editors' Introduction

Thomas D. Beal, D.L. Noorlander, and Susan Goodier

Over 260 years ago, William Smith, Jr. published the first history of New York, *The History of the Province of New-York from the First Discovery to 1732* (1757). Using a political framework, Smith offered readers a narrative history that reflected his professional interests in the law and his social position as part of the “better sort.” At the time, in both Great Britain and its North American colonies there was a growing interest in history, with many writers and readers convinced that understanding the past was necessary to understanding the present. According to historian Michael Kammen, Smith published at a moment when the “history of the recent past fascinated colonial Americans because so often it came to them literally as news.” Unlike historians of Smith’s generation, few historians write narrative histories today. But, even as they explore subjects beyond the world of politics, government and the law, they do share his belief that the past is an essential starting point for developing an understanding of the present. For nearly 100 years, historians, educators, independent scholars and those with a general interest in the state’s history have turned to and relied on *New York History: A Quarterly Journal* for interpretive essays for insight into our past, and therefore our present.¹

This double issue of *New York History* brings volume ninety-nine and our tenure as the journal’s editors to an end. For the past six years, we have edited the journal, contributing material to the process of interpreting the state’s history, which William Smith began so long ago. In “‘We are not objects of pity’: New York City Sailors and the Embargo of 1807” Philip G. Swan focuses on how economic hardships brought on by President Thomas Jefferson’s embargo shaped the political ideology of many sailors

1. William Smith, Jr., *The History of the Province of New-York from the First Discovery to [1732]. To which is annexed, A Description of the Country, with a short Account of the Inhabitants, their Trade, Religious and Political State, and the Constitution of the Courts of Justice in that Colony*, edited by Michael Kammen (London: Thomas Wilcox, 1757; Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1972), xxviii-lxxiii.

who called New York City home. “Not a Model: First Lady Julia Gardiner Tyler and New York City’s Print Culture” offers a dramatic re-interpretation of “The Rose of Long Island,” an iconic broadside advertising the New York City dry good store of Bogert and Mecamy and slandering the image of Julia Gardiner. Thomas Wermuth contributes to the issue’s exploration of popular culture with “‘After the ceremony of the minister was over, the ceremony of the crowd began’: The Evolution of the Skimelton, a Rural New York Wedding Tradition.” While few carry on the tradition of skimelton, surprise parties and gatherings staged only days after couples returned from their honeymoon, Wermuth uncovers the crucial role these events once played in rural communities around New York State.

In “*State v. Charles Conroy: New York City Photographers’ Battle for Free Speech in the Late Nineteenth Century*,” Amy Werbel examines a forgotten court case and its contributions to artistic freedom in the United States. Carol Sheriff then turns to a topic that is especially important during this, the bicentennial period of the construction of the Erie Canal. Sheriff explores how the canal has been commemorated over time and how commemorations in general draw on the past for present-day purposes. Linda Johnson writes about the New York socialite and activist Narcissa Cox Vanderlip in “Plum Blossom Fêtes and Japanese Lantern Balls” and her efforts for peace and improving relations with Japan in the 1920s. Finally, in “High Anxiety in St. Lawrence County,” Neil S. Forkey recounts a fairly recent controversy over U.S. military flights and the problems they caused in upstate New York. He shows how residents organized themselves in opposition to the disruptive flights and how the residents were, in the end, successful in stopping them. We include eight book reviews and a book review essay with this issue. Their topics range from sex and money to education and environmentalism. One review focuses on a book on the DePeyster family and its transition from being loyalists to US citizens and another looks at how immigrants influenced the early development of the US economy. Another reviewer looks at a book on the environment of Manhattan before the Civil War. We have reviews of books on lust, crime, and Anthony Comstock. Wealth is the topic of two reviews, one looks at a book on wealthy suffragists, the other reviews a book about New York’s upper class and how it has changed over the centuries. We also offer a review of a book about a woman who taught the classics

at Vassar. Our book review essay addresses the environmental problems of the Hudson River and the Manhattan waterfront.

Producing *New York History* for the past six years has been both a challenge and a privilege. We could not have published an issue without the help of peer reviewers, colleagues, and friends. In addition, a large number of hard working and committed Research Assistants made valuable contributions to each issue. For them, the journal offered an opportunity to explore the world of academic publishing. Along with the editors, they read, critiqued, researched and discussed the contents of every issue; this process led many to pursue careers in academia, publishing, museum studies, library science and law. We thank them and celebrate their achievements, believing that, at least in part, their success was influenced by their work on the journal. We also thank our readers, who offered words of criticism and encouragement at historical conferences and through correspondence. Their comments helped us produce issues with timely and relevant content.